



**“Gheorghe Asachi” Technical University of Iasi, Romania**



---

## ERRATA

---

The authors of the paper "PROCESS ANALYSIS OF NUTRIENT AND NON-NUTRIENT WATER RESOURCE RECOVERY FACILITIES (WRRFS)," published in volume 22, issue 7/2023, namely Richard O. Mines and André J. Butler, have requested some corrections to be made. We appreciate their diligence in bringing these matters to our attention. The corrections are shown below.

---

### Errata 1

The following phrase (p.1197):

“All biological processes, whether suspended- or attached-growth, remove carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus from wastewater by synthesizing these elements into biomass ( $C_{60}H_{87}O_{23}P$ ), and oxidizing carbon into carbon dioxide and water with other end products resulting.”

will be read as:

“All biological processes, whether suspended- or attached-growth, remove carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus from wastewater by synthesizing these elements into biomass ( $C_{60}H_{87}O_{23}P$ ), and oxidizing carbon into carbon dioxide and water with other end products resulting.“

### Errata 2

The following phrase (p.1197):

“The genus *Nitrosomonas*, oxidizes ammonia to nitrate, and the genus, *Nitrobacter*, oxidizes nitrate to nitrite.”

will be read as:

“The genus *Nitrosomonas*, oxidizes ammonia to nitrite, and the genus, *Nitrobacter*, oxidizes nitrite to nitrate.”

**Errata 3**

Table 4 (p. 1205) will be read in the following form:

**Table 4.** Annual average effluent CBOD, TSS, NH<sub>3</sub>-N, and TP concentrations by facility number

Rank	WRRF Number	Effluent CBOD concentration (mg/L)	WRRF Number	Effluent TSS concentration (mg/L)	WRRF Number	Effluent NH <sub>3</sub> -N concentration (mg/L)	WRRF Number	Effluent TP concentration (mg/L)
1	11	0.01	19	0.05	19	0.03	17	0.03
2	12	0.02	18	0.48	16	0.03	18	0.05
3	19	0.03	17	0.62	9	0.04	12	0.06
4	18	0.71	9	1.00	22	0.05	13	0.08
5	16	1.57	14	< 1.07	18	0.05	16	0.10
6	6	< 1.82	21	< 1.14	7	0.08	21	0.11
7	13	< 2.02	12	1.15	14	0.09	23	0.12
8	14	< 2.02	11	1.17	21	0.09	24	0.12
9	9	2.02	23	1.69	12	0.09	15	0.13
10	21	< 2.08	13	< 1.87	17	0.10	14	0.15
11	15	< 2.31	16	2.01	13	0.12	19	0.21
12	7	2.32	15	< 2.17	23	0.16	9	0.28
13	3	*2.42	22	3.17	20	0.18	8	0.36
14	8	2.67	24	3.36	11	0.18	20	0.37
15	4	2.95	6	3.41	5	0.20	7	0.40
16	10	3.00	3	3.48	15	0.22	11	0.49
17	23	*3.05	20	3.65	24	< 0.35	3	0.63
18	20	3.11	8	4.08	10	0.35	22	0.65
19	22	*3.25	10	4.31	3	0.36	5	0.93
20	5	*3.88	7	5.03	4	0.39	2	1.87
21	1	4.42	4	5.30	6	0.55	4	2.00
22	24	*6.34	1	6.33	8	1.34	6	2.10
23	2	8.93	5	8.03	1	3.88	1	3.38
24	17	**9.95	2	13.7	2	4.08		

\*BOD, \*\*COD

**Errata 4**

Table 5 (p. 1205) will be read in the following form:

**Table 5.** Two-sample, t-test results between NRFs and NNRFs using monthly average values

Parameter	Facilities	N	Mean	Std. Dev.	t-value	p-value
BOD*	NRFs	204	2.15	± 1.58	-7.07	<0.005
	NNRFs	72	4.07	±2.82		
TSS	NRFs	216	2.11	±2.33	-10.22	<0.005
	NNRFs	72	6.71	±5.26		
NH <sub>3</sub> -N	NRFs	216	0.195	±0.556	-8.47	<0.005
	NNRFs	72	1.61	±2.26		
TP**	NRFs	204	0.219	±0.21	-20.28	<0.005
	NNRFs	72	1.82	±1.07		

BOD\* (N= 204 for NRFs since one facility used COD rather than BOD)

TP\*\* (N= 204) for the NRFs since one facility did not measure effluent TP)

## Errata 5

Table 6 (p. 1205) will be read in the following form:

Table 6. Two-sample t-test results between NRFs and NNRFs for spring, summer, fall, and winter

<i>Parameter (Spring)</i>	<i>Facilities</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std. Dev.</i>	<i>t-value</i>	<i>p-value</i>
BOD*	NRFs	51	2.09	± 1.59		
	NNRFs	18	4.34	±3.15	-3.93	<0.005
TSS	NRFs	54	1.91	±1.58		
	NNRFs	18	6.71	±7.84	-5.53	<0.005
NH <sub>3</sub> -N	NRFs	54	8.08	±0.153		
	NNRFs	18	0.142	±2.89	-5.84	<0.005
TP**	NRFs	51	0.205	±0.211		
	NNRFs	18	1.71	±1.08	-9.58	<0.005
<i>Parameter (Summer)</i>	<i>Facilities</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std. Dev.</i>	<i>t-value</i>	<i>p-value</i>
BOD*	NRFs	51	2.27	±1.69		
	NNRFs	18	3.60	±2.28	-2.61	<0.005
TSS	NRFs	54	2.04	±2.23		
	NNRFs	18	4.71	±2.70	-4.16	<0.005
NH <sub>3</sub> -N	NRFs	54	0.221	±0.617		
	NNRFs	18	1.06	±1.23	-3.82	<0.005
TP**	NRFs	51	0.248	±0.207		
	NNRFs	18	1.94	±1.12	-10.40	<0.005
<i>Parameter (Fall)</i>	<i>Facilities</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std. Dev.</i>	<i>t-value</i>	<i>p-value</i>
BOD*	NRFs	51	2.09	±1.45		
	NNRFs	18	3.82	±2.65	-3.44	<0.005
TSS	NRFs	54	1.81	±1.62		
	NNRFs	18	7.06	±4.97	-6.83	<0.005
NH <sub>3</sub> -N	NRFs	54	0.261	±0.896		
	NNRFs	18	0.746	±0.887	-2.00	<0.050
TP**	NRFs	51	0.223	±0.220		
	NNRFs	18	2.25	±1.14	-12.24	<0.005
<i>Parameter (Winter)</i>	<i>Facilities</i>	<i>N</i>	<i>Mean</i>	<i>Std. Dev.</i>	<i>t-value</i>	<i>p-value</i>
BOD*	NRFs	51	2.15	±1.64		
	NNRFs	18	4.50	±3.23	-3.98	<0.005
TSS	NRFs	54	2.68	±3.38		
	NNRFs	18	7.00	±3.96	-4.49	<0.005
NH <sub>3</sub> -N	NRFs	54	0.156	±0.188		
	NNRFs	18	2.20	±2.19	-5.20	<0.005
TP**	NRFs	51	0.198	±0.204		
	NNRFs	18	1.366	±0.799	-9.69	<0.005